



Council of the Isles of Scilly

Preventative Maintenance Housing

Tender Report

31 March 2025

Version: 1.0

Status: Issue

Revision control

Rev	Date	Description of revision	Prepared by	Checked by	Authorised by
1.0	21.03.2025	HL Figures Issued	RW	AI	RW
1.0	31 03 2025	Tender Report	RW	AI	RW

Distribution list

Controlled copies have been distributed to the following personnel:

Copy No	Name of holder	Company	Date issued
1.	Keith Grossett	Council of the Isles of Scilly	31 Mar 2025

## Contact details

### **Aidan Irving, Associate Director**

D 01392 813040  
M 07810 524980  
E Aidan.Irving@curriebrown.com

Currie & Brown UK Limited  
Kensington Court  
Woodwater Park  
Pynes Hill  
Exeter  
EX2 5TY

### **Robert Wotton, Senior Cost Consultant**

D 01392 813040  
M 07733 823247  
E robert.wotton@curriebrown.com

Currie & Brown UK Limited  
Kensington Court  
Woodwater Park  
Pynes Hill  
Exeter  
EX2 5TY

**Contents**

**1. Introduction ..... 4**

1.1 Background ..... 4

1.2 Procurement Strategy ..... 4

1.3 Purpose of Report..... 4

**2. Tender Details ..... 5**

2.1 Summary of Tender Details ..... 5

**3. Tender Analysis..... 6**

3.1 Method of dealing with any errors ..... 6

3.2 Arithmetical accuracy..... 6

3.3 Tender Addendums ..... 6

3.4 Tender Clarifications (Contractors)..... 6

3.5 Tender Clarifications (Client)..... 6

3.6 Disqualified/Reject Tenders ..... 7

3.7 Method of Analysis ..... 7

3.8 Overall Cost Assessment..... 7

3.8.1 Preliminaries:..... 7

3.8.2 Schedule of Works:..... 8

3.8.3 Provisional sum items: ..... 8

Summary ..... 8

**4. Conclusion..... 10**

4.1 Conclusion..... 10

**Appendices**

**Appendix A - Tender Cost Comparison**

## 1. Introduction

### 1.1 Background

The Council of the Isles of Scilly have tendered the following works at the Carn Gwaval Sports Hall:

General repairs to housing in order to provide preventative maintenance

#### Project Details

Item	Detail	Description
A	Project Title	CIOS Preventative Maintenance Housing
B	Project Number	B4101565
C	Project Address	Various
D	Description of Work	General Housing Maintenance internals/externals/M&E/structural etc
E	Contract	JCT Intermediate Contract with Contractors Design 2024
F	Contract Length	11 months

### 1.2 Procurement Strategy

A traditional, single stage open tender process was adopted. The Council of the Isles of Scilly advertised the invitation to tender as an open tender on their e-tender platform which resulted in four returns from the market.

Tenderers were requested to complete a Pricing Template which detailed Preliminaries, Construction Works, Provisional Sums etc.

### 1.3 Purpose of Report

The purpose of this report is to:

- Provide a formal record of tenders received.
- Record the initial examination of tenders,
- Provide a recommendation,

## 2. Tender Details

### 2.1 Summary of Tender Details

Item	Detail	Description
1	No of tenderers	Four
2	Tenderers	Wright construction JWF Corserve Ginnick
3	Contractor's who declined to tender	N/A
4	Contractor's who contravened tender process	N/A
5	Tender prices returned on 17 <sup>th</sup> March 2025	Wright construction - £489k JWF - £645k Corserve - £965k Ginnick - £338k
7	Form of Contract	JCT Intermediate Contract with Contractors Design 2024
8	Contract Programme	11 Months
9	VAT	The submissions are exclusive of VAT

### 3. Tender Analysis

#### 3.1 Method of dealing with any errors

In accordance with Alternative 2 of the JCT Tendering Practice Note 2017, the Contractor will be given the opportunity to either confirm his offer or amend any genuine arithmetical errors found within the Tender Return.

#### 3.2 Arithmetical accuracy

The tenders were all checked for formula errors.

#### 3.3 Tender Addendums

During the tender period, no clarifications were issued.

#### 3.4 Tender Clarifications (Contractors)

No tender clarifications were sought by the contractors during the tender process.

#### 3.5 Tender Clarifications (Client)

During our review of the tender returns, there were several areas identified that require further clarification to be sought from the Tenders, these are listed below along with some general comments following our review :

- Wright
  - Very high price included for Fire Detection – could further substantiation be issued to support these figures?
  - Some items within the pricing schedule are not priced (Some provisional items), can the contractor confirm that these items are included or excluded from their offer?
  - Pricing is generally in line with our Pre Tender estimate
- JWF
  - Prices for works items generally in line with Pretender estimate
  - Large amount of “Dayworks” allowances included, this is therefore not a fixed price offer
  - Preliminary allowances are higher than the Pretender estimate, likely due to them being a mainland contractor
- Corserve
  - Very comprehensive Tender offer received
  - Mainland contractor has allowed for full island preliminary set up at significant cost which are far in excess of the Pretender estimate allowances
  - Works costs generally in line with Pre-tender estimate
  - Not affordable due to prelim allowances
- Ginnick
  - Minimal details received, very low price – unable to assess fully, no prelim items allowed for
  - All items appear to be provisional, therefore need to be fixed before a recommendation can be made.

### 3.6 Disqualified/Reject Tenders

No tenders were rejected but think that Corserve and Ginnick tenders should be discounted at this stage due to the reasons set out above.

### 3.7 Method of Analysis

Tenders were analysed on the basis of cost only.

### 3.8 Overall Cost Assessment

The table below shows the Tender Prices received, also included the Pre Tender Estimate (PTE) figures for information.

Tenderer	Tender Price (£)
Wright	£489,000
JWF	£645,000
Corserve	£965,000
Ginnick	£338,000
PTE	£498,000

Our summary of the costs are noted below:

#### 3.8.1 Preliminaries:

Prelims	Tender Price (£)
Wright – On Island	£41,763
JWF – Off Island	£233,770
Corserve – Off Island	£532,799
Ginnick – On Island	£0.00
PTE - Mixed	£94,000

Off-island contractors have higher preliminary allowances than the on-island companies. Ginnick have offered no details so we are unable to review in any detail. PTE Assumed a mixture of on/off island contractors.



### 3.8.2 Schedule of Works:

Prelims	Tender Price (£)
Wright – Fire suppression costs high, some items not priced	£418,000
JWF – lots of “dayworks”	£381,000
Corserve	£366,000
Ginnick – no details received; all provisional	£308,000
PTE	£375,000

Wright were the most expensive in terms of the works costs, the fire suppression items contributed the most to this difference, it is possible that the fire suppression contractor is from the mainland and Wright may have included for the travel related prelims within the works costs element explaining some of the variances. Most other contractors were within a similar range on the measured works items,

Ginnick provide no details to their quotation so it was difficult to assess their quotation. They have subsequently explained that all figures are provisional, therefore not fixed until the end of the works which represents a risk that costs increase exponentially, and is also not part of a fair tender process.

The PTE was also within a similar range of the returned tenders.

### 3.8.3 Provisional sum items:

Provisional sums were generally priced in line with the documents except for in the following instances:-

Wright appear to have missed a couple of Provisional sum items within the pricing schedule, they will need to confirm if these items are included for elsewhere, or update the quote accordingly.

Corserve have allowed sums in excess of the sums suggested in the pricing documents in some cases, these may need to be adjusted to allow direct comparison with the other tenders.

Extensive “Daywork” allowance included in the JWF quotation, this would indicate that this quotation is not fixed and would be subject to re-measure based on the actual resources required to undertake the works.

### Summary

The main difference between the four tenders is the allowance for preliminary costs, the mainland contractors appear to be significantly higher in terms of this element of pricing in particular Corserve have a significant cost included for this.

Ginnick have offered the lowest price but due to a lack of supporting detail, and the fact the costs are provisional, we have had to discount them from the assessment.

JWF have provided a price which contains a significant amount of “Dayworks” costs which are in effect estimates, therefore we think this should be discounted also.

We have reviewed the tender submissions for the Preventative Maintenance Housing works project. Following our review, Wright Construction have provided the most suitable tender return, however they still would need to provide the requested substantiation to support the fire

suppression allowances, they would also need to confirm that all items are allowed for in their price and to check all provisional sum items contained within the pricing schedule are included.

## **4. Conclusion**

### **4.1 Conclusion**

In conclusion, Wright have provided the most suitable tender return figure and we would therefore recommend that subject to funding and the resolution of the items discussed in this report, they are appointed.

# Appendices

## Appendix A - Tender Cost Comparison



Currie & Brown UK Limited  
Kensington Court, Woodwater Park, Pynes Hill, Exeter, Devon, EX2 5TY  
T | +44(0)1392 813 040 E | [enquiries@curriebrown.com](mailto:enquiries@curriebrown.com)  
[www.curriebrown.com](http://www.curriebrown.com)